SOME NOTES ON FUNDAMENTAL PRINCIPLES: WESTERN SCHOLARSHIP AND THE RELIGION OF THE BAB.

R. Mehrabkhani.

In recent years scholarly papers have appeared in Western countries on the Babi-Baha'i religion the like of which only very rarely emerge in the East. Baha'i writers in Iran have never been able produce works informed by critical analysis; not only because most of them were not used to this kind of methodology but also in view of the fact that enemies of their newly-born Faith were ever ready to attack them and latch onto any word or expression that might further their hostile aims. Iranian Baha'i literature is thus a kimd of apology, a defence of the Faith.

Scholars in western countries, on the other hand, have also, in certain cases failed to grasp important fundamentals. Some among them have failed to penetrate the religious milieu within which the Babī-Bahā'ī Cause emerged; they have neither gained an adequate notion of what religion is nor befittingly set, for example, the Babī-Faith within in 19th century Iranian religious environment.

Babī history and doctrine are spoken about in largely socio-polit-ical terms as if the Babī Faith were a 'political movement'. This undoubtedly leads to wrong judgements.

In this paper the present writer will attempt to discuss certain fundamental principles which, it is hoped, will help Western scholars to gain a more adequate grasp of the religion of the Bab. A narrowly historical and non-theological approach to religion is severely limited. The divine plan and purpose behind historical events must be apprecia--ted. The eminent Baha'i scholar Mirza Abu'l-Fadl Gulpaygani -erved that scholars have made great mistakes in taking a narrowly hist--orical approach to the revealed Books--outside of an understanding of them in the light of the Divine Purpose. 1. More recently H.M. Balyuzi has written as follows about the inadequacy of the western understanding of the Arabian Prophet: " This inadequacy among western authors may be traced to a fundamental lack of the appreciation of the full claims and the Mission of the Prophet. However greatly impressed by the achievements, character and even doctrines, their judgement of Muhammad Himself and their evaluation of his Faith cannot be other than suspect when their fundamental conviction was that he was a deluded imposter." 2.

Those who attempt to study the history of a religion in purely historical terms and in disregard of the religious teachings of its Founder Messenger may discover contradictions. It should be borne in mind however, that the exigiences of the Divine Wisdom not only necessitate a progressive revelation of religious truth in terms of the succession of religions but also within the span of a single religion. Like a loving father God gradually and in a variety of ways guides his creatures.

It is unfortunate that western scholars of the early years of the Bābī-Bahā'ī religion have, in some cases, failed to realise the progress-ive or gradual unfoldment of the religious message conveyed and have thereby misrepresented its historical evolution.

I. THE CLAIMS OF THE BAB

The study of the claims of the Bab should be made in the context of God's plan for mankind through his Messengers as expressed in Babi scripture.

In the Bāb's writings it is explained that the Founders of all rel-igions, though they appeared in different places and at different times,
have all been manifestations of the same Divine Reality; "We discriminate
against none of His apostles". 3. The "Days" or dispensations of these
great Founder Prophets have though, in the light of varying human capacit-ies and the levels of the greatness of the Message, never been the same;
"We have exalted some above others". 4. In the revealed Books mention is
made of a future "Day of Days" or "Day of God". The end of the cycle of
prophethood is announced in the Qur'ān in the light of the world being at
the threshold of the "Day of God". The Prophet Muhammad was the "Seal of the
Prophets" 5. His religious dispensation will be followed by the arrival of
the Day of God which is the "Day" when humanity will behold their God
walking among them on earth.

In many of his writings the Bab declared that the expected "Day of God" had arrived and that the promised One of all ages had appeared. His claims should be viewed in this light. Consider the following excerpts from his writings:

When God sent forth His Prophet Muhammad, on that Day the termination of the prophetic cycle was foreordained in the knowledge of God. Yea, that promise hath indeed come true and the decree of God hath been accomplished as He hath ordained. Assuredly we are today living in the Days of God. These are the glorious days on the like of which the sun hath never risen in the past. These are the days which the people of bygone times eagerly expected. What then hath befallen

you that ye are fast asleep? These are the days wherein God hath caused the Day-Star of Truth to shine resplendent. What hath then caused you to keep your silence?...

"Fear ye God and breathe not a word concerning His most Great Remembrance other than what hath been ordained by God, inasmuch as We have established a separate covenant regarding Him with every Prophet and his followers. Indeed, We have not sent any Messenger without this binding coven—ant amd We do not, of a truth, pass judgement upon anything except after the covenant of Him Who is the Supreme Gate hath been established.." 7.

These passages illustrate the real claims made by the Bab. Such claims were in fact made by him at the very outset of his mission. He did however, gradually and in the light of the capactities of his hearers, intimate his ultimate claims. As we shall see he early on referred to himself as "the Gate" (bab) giving the impression that he was an intermediary between the hidden Imam and the believers. He represented his words as being the words of the hidden Imam and drew on Shīcī concepts surrounding the advent of the promised Qarim and his occultation.

In order to appreciate the gradual nature of his Bab's intimation of his ultimate claims one has to take into account the contemporary Muslim attitudes surrounding-:

A) The claim to Divinity

The idea of calling a prophet "God"—— not problematic for Christians—was out of the question for Muslim theologians.

In Islam a prophet is a man chosen by God to be his Messenger; throughout his life he remains a man. Those verses in the Qur'an that mention the "meeting" (liqa") with God on the "Day of Resurrection" 8 were not taken literally. Commentators interpreted them in terms of "reward and punishment" and the "power of God" and the like in connection with the "Day of Resurrection". Though some Muslim mystics that by virtue of their "dying to self" and "living in God" they could legitimately say "I am the Truth" they were condemned as heretics. Husayn ibn—i Mansur Hallaj was brutally tortured and condemned to death for such a claim. 10.

believed

B) The claim to Divine Revelation

Muslims were very sensitive to any claim to be capable of revealing verses (<u>nuzul-i ayat</u>); no one could claim that verses had been revealed to him subsequent to the mission of the Prophet of Islam. They belie-

that <u>avat</u> (= verses) came only to the Prophet Muhammad <u>through</u> the Angel Gabriel. The Prophet did not himself reveal verses but received them from God via Gabriel often having to wait months or even years before receiving them.

Apart from the Qur'an there is of course the question of the hadith qudsi or "hely tradition"—also known as the "Lordly" and "Divine" tradition (hadith—i rabbani / hadith—i illahi). It is commonly believed that these are records of revelations that came upon the Prophet Muhammad through Gabriel while he was asleep—in his dreams—or in a visionary state. They are not to be compared to Qur'anic revelation or the ayat.

None of the Shīcī Imāms ever claimed that his words were ayat, divinely revealed verses. Not even the eloquent and much-praised words of Imām cAlī contained in the Nahj al-Balagha are considered to be the "Word of God"— they are greater than the utterances of of men but inferior to the "Word of God".

The Muslim notion of Divine Revelation is such that the <u>ayat</u> are considered to be the proof of the prophethood of Muhammad. This is indicated in the Qur'an itself: "If men and jinn (the people of this world and the next) combined to write the like of this Qur'an, they surely would fail to compose like it, though they helped one another."

C) The claim to abrogate Qurtanic law.

Muslims are unanimously agreed that the laws of the Qur'an will never be changed or abrogated. All the laws of the Qur'an will ever endume until the end of the world. The expected Qa'im or Mahdī will rule according to the laws and precepts of the Qur'an. The advent of Jesus in the last days, intimated in the Qur'an, 12. is such that this will not lead to the alteration or abolition of Qur'anic law. The Messiah at his second-coming will live according to Islamic law.

The miserable fate that befell Mulia Sadiq-i Khurasani when he, in line with an injunction of the Bab, added a clause to the accepted adhan formula illustrates how sensitive Muslims were to the least deviation from legal norms. Although Mulia Sadiq was an outstanding mujtahid his act created such an uproar that according to Nabil, "the whole city [Shīrāz] had been aroused, and public order was, as a result,

seriously threatened. 13. His beard was burnt, his nose pierced, and through this incision a cord was passed by means of which he was paraded through the streets.

In the light of the foregoing it is not at all suprising that that Bab gradually intimated his ultimate claims and purposes. The present writer is amazed that western scholars have sometimes failed to realise this especially inasmuch as the same pattern may be seen in the lives of other great Prophets.

It is generally accepted today that Christianity was, from the beginning intended to be a universal religion applicable to all mankind; and not a localised religion exclusively for the Jews. It should not noted however, that Jesus did not teach this at the outset of his mission. He said, " I am not sent but unto the lost sheep of the house of Israel" 14. When he sent his disciples out to teach he instructed them saying. " Go not into the way of the Gentiles and into any city of the Samaritans enter not. 15. Particularly striking is the case of the woman of Canaan who asked Jesus' help for her daughter; "He answered and said, I am not sent but unto the lost sheeep of the house of Israel... It is not meet to take the children's bread and cast it to the dogs." 16. With respect to the Jewish law Christ is recorded as having said-: " It is easier for heaven and earth to pass away, than for one dot of the law to become void*: 17. "Think not that I am come to abolish the law and the prophets; I have not come to abolish them but to fulfill them ".These words may be contrasted with the developed Christ--ian conviction that the Jewish law is no longer applicable to Christians.

The prophet Muhammad's gradual introduction of Islamic law is also worthy of detailed study. He educated his contemporaries according to their evolving capacity. Initially for example, he was lenient with respect to idolatry as the following verse indicates: "Say: Unbelievers, I do not worship what you worship nor do you serve what I worship. You have your own religion and I have mine." 19. At one point during his mission he was not strongly condemnatory of drinking; "They ask you about drinking and gambling. Say: there is great harm in both, although they have some benefit for men; but their harm is far greater than their benefit." Then, seeing that some believers came to the congregational prayer completely drunk the following verse was revealed: "Believers.

do not approach your prayers when you are drunk, but wait until you can grasp the meaning of your words." ²¹ Subsequently the following verse was revealed, "Believers, Wine and games of chance, idols and divining arrows, are abominations devised by Satan. Avoid them so that you may prosper." ²²

It was in the light of the limited capacity of his contemporaries that the Bāb gradually introduced his claims. In his <u>Dalā'il-i</u>

<u>Sab^Ca</u> he writes:

"Consider the manifold favours vouchsafed by the Promised One, and the effusions of His bounty which have pervaded the concourse of the followers of Islam to enable them to attain unto salvat—ion. Indeed, observe how He Who representeth the origin of creation, He Who is the exponent of the verse, 'I, in very truth, am God', identified himself as the Gate[Bab] for the advent of the promised Qa'im, a descendant of Muhammad, and in His first Book enjoined the observance of the laws of the Qur'an, so that the people might not be seized with perturbation by reason of a new Book and a new Revelation and might regard His Faith as similar to their own, perchance they would not turn away from the Truth and ignore the thing for which they had been called into being." 23.

At this point it should be kept in mind that the gradual education the Bab gave his followers was not in a way, as some scholars have thought, that he initially presented Himself as a Shaykhi leader or pretended only to be the "Gate" of the Hidden Imam. The fact is that at the same time that He was trying to say things through which his contemporaries " might regard His Faith as similar to their own" he claimed to reveal ayat after the manner of the Prophet Muhammad. He, furthermore, claimed Divinity and that the promised "Day of God" had arrived. Consider the following verses from the early Qayyum al-Asma':

On the revelation of Ayat;

"Verily We made the revelation of verses (ayat) to be the testimony of Our Message unto you. Can you produce a single letter to match these verses? Bring forth, then, your proofs, if ye be of those who can discern the one true God. I solemnly affirm before God, should all men and spirits combine to compose the like of one chapter of this Book, they would assuredly fail, even though they were to assist one another." 24.

"We have, of a truth, sent down this divinely-inspired Book unto Our servant..." 25.

"Verily such as ridicule the wonderous, divine Verses revealed through His Remembrance, are but making them—selves the objects of ridicule.." 26.

On the claim to Divinity and the "Day of God"

- "The Lord hath, in truth, inspired Me: Verily, Verily, I am God, He besides Whom there is none other God, and I am indeed the Ancient of Days.." 27.
- **O My servants! This is God's appointed Day which the merciful Lord hath promised you in his Book.. ** 28.
- "Indeed We conversed with Moses by the leave of God from t he midst of the Burning Bush in the Sinai and revealed an infinitesimal glimmer of Thy Light upon the Mystic Mount and its dwellers, whereupon the Mount shook to its foundations and was crushed to dust.."

The abrogation of Islamic Law

This third aspect of the Bāb's claims, destined to shake the foundations of Islām, was only fully accomplished during the later years of the Bāb's ministry when the Persian Bayān was revealed. There are however, in the Bāb's earlier writings, passages in which new precepts are introduced. On his return from pilgrimage for example, the Bāb, anticipating later pronouncements, introduced seven new legalistic precepts in his newly composed Khasā'il—i Sabca. 30. They, as far as Muslims were concerned, were unacceptable innovations (bidcāt) marking their author out as a heretic. The previously mentioned addition to the adhān formula, in fact, "I bear witness that He whose name is call before Muhammad [=the Bāb] is the servant of the Bāqīyyatallāh[= the Hidden Imām]", was particularly unacceptable. Nabīl's account of Mullā Sādiq's voicing this new Bābī adhān formula set down in the Khasā'il—i Sabca bears eloquent testimony to extent to which Muslims regarded it as heretical. 31.

At the beginning of his prophetic mission the Bab expressed 'triple claims' about which Muslims were extra sensitive; that is, 1) He claimed Divinity and spoke of the arrival of the Day of God; 2) He claimed the revelation of verses (<u>nuzul-i ayat</u>) and 3) He began to undermine the stronghold of Islamic Law—unimaginable to Muslims. At the same time He made less exalted claims that would satisfy those with limited capacity

^{*} In the traditional Shīcī call to prayer the reality of the Divine Oneness (tawhīd), Prophethood (risalat) and Guardianship(wilāyat) are affirmed. No orthodox Muslim ever considered adding anything new to the call to prayer let alone the name of one claiming special authority.

and hold back the clamour of the culama. He acted as a wise and loving spiritual physician; first administering small sugar-coated doses of medicine. Despite this there were divines who could not tolerate the least innovation or who reacted to the Bab's great claims. Many denounced him including Haji Muhammad Karīm Khan Kirmanī who cried out in desperation, "Our God is not his God, our Prophet is not his Prophet, and our Imam is not his Imam." 32.

To sum up: from the very beginning of his mission the Bab conceived the supreme revelation promised in all previous religions. He spoke in accordance with the capacity of the people of his day though it would be incorrect to maintain that he merely wanted to claim leadership of the Shaykhī school—in rivalry with Karīm Khān Kirmānī and such other claimants to leadership after Siyyid's Kāzim Rashtī's passing as Mullā Muhammad—i Māmāqānī. 33.

THE CONCEPT OF HOLY WAR IN THE BABI DISPENSATION.

The notion of war against unbelievers and the imposition of religion by the sword in the Babi dispensation is one of the issues that has given rise to speculative statements. 34.

Before turning directly to this question and in the light of the previously mentioned importance of a comparative approach to the study of religion—the plan of God mirrored in all religions—reference may be made to the example of Jesus who, according to certain New Testament texts, was not exactly the gentle pacifist he is popularly imagined to be.

In his book The Death of Christ Joel Carmichael has, in recent times, discussed the possibly revolutionary intentions of Jesus Christ. 35. He argines, on the basis of New Testament texts, that Jesus was a mi litant revolutionary referring in particular to his being called "King of the Jews", his cleansing of the Jerusalem Temple! (allegedly necessitating armed disciples) and his words recorded in Luke 12:49, Matthew 10:14 and Luke 22:36. The disciples of Jesus carried arms 36. the same has been said of the disciples of the Bab (see below).

To what extent Carmichael is right is not easy to determine. The New Testament texts raise difficult questions similar to those raised in the Babi sources. One can easily go astray in attempting to resolve such issues.

The apparently mil itant directives of Jesus and the Bab were made in accordance with the capacities and expectations of Jews and Muslims regarding their promised one. The interesting parallelism between the ministry of the Bab and that of Jesus has been referred to by Shoghi Effendi: "The passion of Jesus Christ and indeed the whole of his public ministry alone offers a parallel to the mission and death of the Bab which no student of comparative religion can fail to percieve or ignore". 37.

To return to the question of Holy War in Babism. A comprehensive study of the writings of the Bab on this matter in comparison with a consideration of His actions and those of His disciples leads, at first sight, to a clear contradiction between them.

In his writings the Bab writes—theoretically—about jihad ("holy war") and often uses the same expressions as are found in the Qur'an. In practise however, he advises his disciples or counsels his followers to be mild, compassionate and forgiving towards those who oppose Him and his religion. His Christlike gentleness led him to view others with compassion though the Muslim expectations as to the character of the expected Qa'im led him to speak theoretically about jihad.

The Bab's 'Farewell Address of the Letters of the Living" illustrates how he called upon his followers to lead such saintly lives that others would be attracted to his Religion through their example. 38. His writings contain passages such as the following; " It is better to guide one soul than to possess all that is on earth... The path to guidance is one of love and compassion, not of force and coercion. This hath been God's method in the past and shall continue to be in the future!" 39.; " Take heed to carefully consider the words of every soul, then hold fast to the proofs which attest the truth. If ye fail to discover truth in a person's words, make them not the object of contention. 40. When the Bab decided upon the expulsion of Mulla Javad, a covenant-breaker and fierce ememy of His, He wrote with suffering heart: " At the time when I was writing the decree of his expulsion, it was as if one were calling within My heart, 'Sacrifice the most beloved of all things unto you, even as Husayn (Imam Husayn) made sacrifice in My path ***. 41. Had he wished to act according to Islamic law he might have instead acted in accordance with the following Qurtanic verse. "But if after coming to terms with you, they break their oaths and revile your Faith, make war on the leaders of unbelief." 42.

During the Bab's stay in Isfahan as a guest of Manuchihr Khan the He was addressed by his host as follows;

"The Almighty Giver has endowed me with great riches...Now that I have by the aid of God, been led to recognise this Revelation, it is my ardent desire to consercrate all my possessions to the furtherance of its interests...It is my intention to proceed, by Your leave, to Tihran and do my best to win to this Cause, Muhammad Shah, whose confidence in me is firm and unshaken.."

His reply to this noble offer was:

"May God requite you for your noble intentions. So lofty a purpose is even to me more precious than the act itself..

Not by the means which you fondly imagine will an Almighty Providence accomplsih the triumph of His Faith. Through the poor and lowly of this land, by the blood which these shall have shed in His path, will the Omnipotent Sovereign ensure the preservation and consolidate the foundation of His Cause." 43.

When the Bab was on his way to Adhirbayjan some believers from Qazvin and Zanjan collected the necessary forces to go to his rescue. This group overtook the guards at the hour of midnight and finding them fast asleep, approached the Bab and begged him to flee. The mountains of Adhirbayjan too have their claims 44 was his confident reply, and he advised them to abandon their project and return to their homes.

It is recorded, on the other hand, that whilst being conducted to Mah-Ku the Bab sent messages to two men in positions of authority requesting that they accomplish his deliverance. One was Sulayman Khan-i Afshar whose son was married to a daughter of Siyyid Kazim and who was in Zanjan at that time. His message was "I am the Prom-ised One. Arise and deliver me from the hands of the oppressors." The other was Prince Bahram Mirza the then governor of Adhirbayjan. Both of these men ignored the Bab's appeal.

How can the student of the ministry of the Bab resolve such contradict-ions? While in the Qayyum al-Asma' the Shah of Persia is exhorted to arise and propagate the Babi cause with the sword the Bab is also known to have refused Manuchihr Khan's offer of assistance. The youthful Mess-enger of Shīraz requests deliverance from leading men on the way to Adhirbayjan but when a group of his followers attempt this they are lovingly commanded to withdraw!

These difficulties can be resolved in the light of the <u>Sh</u>ī^cī notion of the character of the promised Qā'im who was not expected to be a man of compassion and grace. He was to be a man of the sword who

would declare was against all the inhabitants of the earth. The ensuing bloodbath would be such that its wave is to reach up to the stirrups of his horse. The Bab made statements in line with this image of the Qa'im but did not desire the concrete waging of holy war. He spoke of holy war but did not put it into practise. He appealed to the powerful of his day in order to test their faith for, when assistance was offered, he refused it. His various direct—ives regarding holy war were designed to indicate the fulfilment of time—honoured Islamic traditions: not destined to be literally fulfil—ed. His contemporaries were not completely ready for radical reinter—pretations of the prophecies. The Bab educated and prepared his follow—ers for the era to come. Though the new age had dawned with the Bab certain changes, such as the clear abrogation of holy war, had to await the manifestation of Baha'u'llah.

In his attitude to holy war the Bab gradually educated his follow--ers, especially his close disciples, This is clear from the historical sources. In spite of the pronouncements regarding holy war in the Qayyum al-Asma* the sources do not lead us to believe that leading Babis prep--ared for any insurrection. Those who took part in the episodes ofTabarsi, Zanjan and Nayriz were protecting themselves and ready martyrdom. 46. During the Zanjan upheaval Hujjat clearly declared: ...During all this period of strife, what day hath there been or what night, wherein I have commanded a religious war save only that I constantly considering how we might ward off your assaults from our wiv--es and children, for we have no choice but to defend." 47. In a letter from Hujjat to one of the divines of Zanjan , extant in his own handwriting, we read, " Tell the governor who has been deceived by your tricks, that it is enough of that. Let him stop sedition and disperse the army from around us and we are ready to continue our subjection. By God, the same king who is the object of your worship, will rise in anger against you if he informed of your acts." 48.

Some students of Bābī history who have enjoyed the life-long security of the western world have argued that Bābī millitancy is proven by the fact that certain groups of Bābīs are said to have been armed. i.e. those Bābīs who accompanied Tāhira from Karbala to Iran. Such arguments are misdirect-ed. In 19th century Iran there was no real police force to protect the peoples. Travellers had to be prepared to face the attacks of thieves and armed groups which were widespread. Macdonald Kinneir who visited Khūrāsān

towards the beginning of the 19th century wrote: "The inhabitants, in constant fear of being attacked. never go unarmed. They even cultivate their gardens with their swords by their sides."

The present writer has vivid recollection of two experiences dating from the time when the Pahlavi dynasty had established a relatively peaceful situation in Iran. They may throw light on alleged 19th century Babi militancy.

In the spring of 1942 I arrived in Nayrīz in order to spend some time with the courageous Bahā'īs of that town, the descendents of the dawn-breakers of the Bahā'ī era. I noticed that in the town, though there was a governor and a small body of police, there was no real authority. In view of this the government had allowed wealthy citizens to engage their own armed men (tufangchīs). One of them was the chairman of the local Bahā'ī Assembly. Wherever he went an armed man accompanied him. His name was Mr. Mansūrī. When the Bahā'ī Assembly met he used to sit outside the door of the room in which his master attended to Bahā'ī business.

On another occasion during the month of Muharram of the same year and at the same place, I noted that the Bahā'īs and the Muslims lived in two different parts of the town—separated by a dry river-bed. News came that the Muslims had decided that on the 10th of Muharram they would stage a procession through the Bahā'ī sector. At the instigation of the Mullas they planned to attack, kill and plunder Bahā'īs and their properties. In view of this the Bahā'īs requested protection from the governor. He bluntly promised nothing and advised the Bahā'īs to be ready to defend themselves. The Bahā'īs decided that in order to put a stop to the savagery of the Muslim fanatics they would have to be seen to be powerful and ready to defend themselves. In consequence a number of armed men (tufangchīs) were dispatched to the roofs of the houses of the main street through which the Muslim procession was to pass. This action had the desired result. The Muslim procession passed peacefully through the main street. There was no disturbance.

Of the three major Babi upheavals, those at Tabarsi, Zanjan and Nayriz, it is regarding that at Tabarsi that we have the most first-hand information. Eye-witness testimony indicates that from the moment Mulla Husayn raised the black-standard until the end of the Mazandaran upheaval there was no effort to collect arms. One source has it that when the Babis arrived at the shrine of Shaykh Tabarsi they had only seven guns in their possess-ion.

At this point I should like to contrast what one student of the Babī religion has written about the arrival of Mulla Husayn in Barfurush and subsequently Tabarsī with the testimony of a source written down when the Mazandaran upheaval was hardly finished.

It has been recently written that,

"In order to avoid further trouble, Hamza Mirza ordered Bushru'i to leave Mashhad and, on 19 Shacban 1264 / 21 July 1848, he set out with a large body of fellow Babis, ostensibly heading for the Shici shrines in Iraq.Travell—ing towards Mazandaran, this party, swelled somewhat in numbers by new arrivals along the route, reached Barfurush on 12 Shawwal / 12 September and there clashed seriously with local inhabitants trying to prevent their entry to the town.Penetrating more deeply into the forest region of Mazandaran province, they reached the shrine of Shaykh Abu CAli al-Fadl Tabarsi om 22 Shawwal / 24 September ." 51.

In this short account, of course, the writer has not had the space to go into details and explain how the clash began or record subsequent events; to explain why the Babis penetrated deeply into forest region of Mazandaran and how they came to arrive at the shrine of Shaykh Tabarsi. The impression is given that Mulla Husayn wanted to enter Barfurush by force; hence the journeying into the forest region of Mazandaran in order to find a suitable place to build a fort. The chronicle of Lutf CAli Mirza indicates a different perspective.

Lutf ^CAlī Mīrzā-yi Shīrāzī was a prince of the Af<u>sh</u>āriyya dynasty (a pre-Qajar ruling class) who, dressed in the garb of a Sufi, joined Mullā Husayn; Bābī companions at Dih-i Mullā. He was among the survivors of the Māzandārān upheaval-along with Mullā Sādiq-i Muqaddas. He never completed his eye-witness account of the upheaval due to his martyrdom in 1852 though what was written down includes the following account:

"[On entering the town] that head of the wretched ones (Sacid al-Culama) had ordered that a large crowd of three or four thousand, with firearms, staves, and stones be ready and not let us enter the bazaar. Aqā Siyyid Zayn al-CAbidīn who was in front of the companions said: 'We are pilgrims and we have come a long way. The king has died and the roads are unsafe. This is the land of believers; we shall be your guests for a few days, until the king occupies his throne and the country is secure; then we shall go away'. 'You are not pilgrims', they said, 'and we shall not let you enter'. At length His Holiness (Mullā Husayn) ordered us to return and make our own way out. Those accursed ones started to treat us shamelessly and persecuted the friends. They took the companions property and harmed them. The companions asked permission from that Qutb al-Aqtab (Mullā Husayn) to defend themsel-ves, but he did not allow them to. We reached the corner of the Sabzih Maydan ('Green Square'). Here they (the enemies) unloaded the horse of

Aqa Mahmud of Isfahan and then a shot was heard. Aqa Siyyid Rida, an old man of seventy, fell down dead. Another shot was heard and Mulla Cali of Miyanih, who had not yet completed his youth, fell. Mulla Husayn unsheathed his sword and turned back.....

Lutf ^cAlī Mīrzā goes on to relate how the Bābīs came to reach the shrine of Shaykh Tabarsī:

".. A rider came and announced that Khusraw Khan (Qadi-Kala'i)wanted to talk to us. His Holiness (Mulla Ḥusayn) sent Āqā Siyyid Zayn al-CAbidin.That accursed one (Khusraw Khan) had said, 'You have killed thirty-seven people of Barfurush .How can you go on your way? Aqa Zayn al-Tabidin had answered to the effect that it had been their fault and they they had first started things off by killing some [Babi] comp--anions. That accursed one (Khursaw Khan) had said that killing us [the Babis] was lawful and that he would not allow us to depart... That accursed one (Khusraw Khan) entered the presence of His Holiness (Mulla Husayn) and it was agreed that he Khusraw Khan] would escort the companions [Babis] safely out of Mazandaran and that then Mulla Husayn's horse and sword and everything else of our [the Babis']possessions that he might ask would be given to him. While the conversation was going on they started to take possession of our properties. One took the horse of a companion [Babi] away and the other seized another comp--anions sword from his hand... The companions [Babīs] started off and enemies began to attack. One [enemy] came and took the sword from the hand of the companion [a Babi] and if he followed him [that enemy] into the forest they [the enemies] would cut him to pieces... Then his holiness (Mulla Husayn) took an unsheathed sword and said to that accursed dog (Khusraw Khan), 'If you want to kill me here is my neck; take this sword and kill me, but let the companions go free and do not trouble them. ... Anyhow, when night came the calamity increased, the groans and complaints of the friends Babis augumented. The enemies laid hands on the companions [Babis'] possessions; half of the companions [Babis] were stripped of their clothes and wounded; scattered in the forest... Then he (Mulla Husayn) asked if there was a place nearby where we [the Babis] could stay. He [the guide] said that there was a shrine close by... Three or four hours before sunrise we reached Shaykh Tabars I ...All the companions [Babis] gathered around him [Mulla Husayn]. Then he [Mulla Husayn] said: 'We will all be maytyred in this place. The enem--ies will soon attack us and shed our blood. The companions asked him if it was ordained by God, if so they were satisfied with it; but if it was not ordained he should ask God to change it. He answered saying: God desires to reveal His Truth in this way, just as He did so in the time of the Prince of Martyrs [Imam Husayn].."

This heart-rending account of Mīrzā Lutī ^cAlīdoes not lead us to believe that Bahā'ī historians have suppressed the real facts of history or concealthe mil itant character of the Bābīs.Mullā Husayn is presented in an even more gentle way than in the Tārīkh-i Nabīl ['The Dawn-Breakers'].

THE EARLY FOLLOWERS OF THE BAB

The lives of the early followers of the founders of the great world religions have ever inspired passion and enthusiasm in subsequent gener--ations of believers. The early days of the emergence of a world faith marks a turning point in history and souls of extraordinary capacity stand ready to face the greatest of tests, often sacrificing all that they possess including their precious lives. Though little is known about the earliest adherants of most of the great world religions the study of Christianity and Islam illustrates that they were largely from the lowest level of society and bereft of culture and learning. For this among other reasons, the great Messengers of God were not taken seriously by the learned of their day. In the time of Muhammad those of high rank repeated what had been said at the time of Noah: "We regard you as a mortal like ourselves. Nor can we find any among your followers but men of hasty judgement, the lowest of our tribe." It was similar at the time of Christ whose Cause was ignored by leading Rabbis and members of the Jewish hierarchy. Hence Jesus' praying. " I thank thee to Father, Lord of heaven and earth, that thou hast hidden these things from the wise and understanding and revealed them to babes.." 53. and Paul's saying, "But God hath chosen the in the world to shame the strong. 54.

During the dispensation of the Bab the learned and wise, forgetting rank and position, responded to the heavenly voice of the Manifestation of God. Mention will here be made of a few learned Babis in view of the fact that some writers have supposed that the learned deserted the Bab when they became aware of the real nature of his Cause. The submission of outstandingly learned men to the youthful Siyyid of Shīrāz is a remarkable phenomenon that cannot adequately be accounted for outside of the recognit—ion of His Divine Power.

- 1) Mulla Sadiq Muqaddas Khurasani was an outstanding Iranian Mujtahid who received his <u>ijazih</u> ('authorization') from Siyyid Kazim. In it the Shaykhī leader refers to him as "my trustworthy brother", "an accomplished scholar", one "superior among his peers, because of his outstanding insight and sharp intelligence, a possessor of both rational (macqul) and tradit——ional (manqul) [learning]." At the time of the Bab's declaration Mulla Sadiq was resident in Isfahan. He enjoyed the highest degree of honour such that 4,000 Muslims followed him in the congregational Friday prayers. On believing in the Bab he suffered the calamity which befell him in Shiraz (see above). He took part in the Mazandaran uphexval (see above), was released following its suppression and lived a long life during which he was both faithful and ever ready to give his life for the Babi Cause.
- 2) Mulla Muhammad CAli Hujjat-i Zanjani was another outstanding mujtahid who gave his life for the Babi Cause His father Mulla CAbd al-Rahman was

was one of the most distinguished mujtahids of Zanjān. After completing his studies in Zanjān Hujjat himself travelled to Iraq where he undertook advanced study. On his return to Iran he was already so famous that a great crowd gathered to meet him in Kirmanshāh. The inhabitants of Hamadān begged him not to proceed to Zanjān but stay amongst them; this he did for some two years until the death of his father (in Zanjān). At the request of the people of Zanjān he took over the position of his father. His influence in Zanjān was great. He acquired more power that the other Mullas who, unlike himself, made a business of their religion. 56.

On hearing of the Babī Cause he sent one of his disciples, Mulla Iskandar, to Shīraz to investigate it. His emissary had become a Babī and when he presented Hujjat with some writings of the Bab he, after reading only one page, prostrated himself and exclaimed, "I bear witness that these words which I have read proceed from the same source as that of the Qur'an. Whoso hath recognised the truth of that sacred Book must needs testify to the Divine Origin of these words."

Hujjat was steadfast in the Babī Cause until his last moment. He showed much heroism and courage in propagating it. His story has inspired many historians to write about him at great length. He died a martyr's death along with more than 1,000 of his companions.

3) Siyyid Yahya Vahid was another outstanding divine who believed in the Bab and gave his life for his Cause. His father was the famed author of many books. Vahid also attained the highest level of religious knowledge being well-versed in figh and usul. It is said that he had memorised 30,000 Islamic traditions (ahadith). He was highly regarded by Muhammad Shah by the time news was circulating about the claims of the Bab and was asked to travel to Shīraz to investigate the matter. At Shīraz he became a Babī. A treatise is extant in his own handwriting in which he sets down many proofs of the truth of the Bab; acknowledging, for example, that the Bab was, though an unlettered Persian, capable of revealing 1,000 verses in Arabic in only six hours and answering the most abstruse questions. The Bab's power of revelation seemed miraculous to Siyyid Yahya, a miracle which he could not refute. He found, whilst a guest of the Bab, that the Bab's manners, moods and behavoir were beyond normal human capacities. In his treatise about the Bab he apllies to him the following Arabic poem: "If you attained his presence you would find the whole of humanity in one Man, Eternity in one Hour and the whole earth in one House. ** 57.

Siyyid Yahyā led the upheaval in Nayrīz and gave his life in the path of his Beloved ten days before the Bab was martyred in Tabrīz.

- 4) Mulla Husayn -i Bushru'i was a highly knowledgeable, pious and well-regarded disciple of Siyyid Kazim Rashti. During the lifetime of his master he wrote books and commentaries on the Qur'an. He was so praised by Siyyid Kazim that that the thought arose that his might be the Promised One—much spoken of by Siyyid Kazim. 58. When the time came to send someone to touch the lion's tail Mulla Husayn was chosen. 59. It is well known that Mirza Muhammad Baqir-i Shafti grecatly praised him 60. and how highly regarded he was by such great divines as Mulla Cabd al-Khaliq-i Yazdi, Mulla Muhammad Taqī-yi Hiravi, Mmrza Ahmad-i Azghandi, Siyyid Cali-yi Bushr and, Shaykh Bashīr-i Najafi (all disciples of Siyyid Kazim). 61. The story of his coming to faith in the Bab has been set down elsewhere along with details regarding his services and martyrdom in the Babi Cause.
- 5) Mirzā Ahmad-i Azghandī was "the most eloquent, the wisest and the most eminent" among the culama of Khurasan. 62. He was the first to believe in that province and was converted by Mulla Husayn. After becoming a Babī he travelled to Shīrāz in order to attain the presence of his Beloved. On the way he "compiled a voluminous compilation of traditions and prophecies about the Bab. He collected more than twelve thousand traditions in his

- book. Throughout his long life he remained steadfast in the Babī Cause for which he had sacrified wealth, reputation and all else besides.
- 6) Mulla Yusuf-i Ardibili, a confident of Siyyid Kazim, was one of the most eminent Shaykhi culama. His eloquence was such that he was [even] praised by Haji Muhammad Karim Khān -i Kirmani. A native of Adhirbayjan he, having accepted the Bab's claims, taught his faith in that province to large numbers of people. He was widely travelled and eventually died a martyr during the Mazandaran upheaval. 64.
- 7) Haji Siyyid Javad-i Karbala'i was the grandson of the renowned Siyyid Mahdi, Bahr al- CUlum. He was born, brought up and studied in Karbala and was a leading disciple of both Shaykh Ahmad and Siyyid Kazim. He also studied with some of the outstanding Iranian Culama. After completing his studies he went to India and associated with all manner of peoples before returning to Iraq. After perusing some of the Bab's writings he became a believer without hesitation and journeyed to Shiraz to meet his Beloved. He attained an advanced age and met and came to believe in Baha'u'llah. The eminent Baha'i scholar Mirza Abū al-Fadl Gulpaygani considered himself a pupil of Siyyid Javad during the time that they both resided in Tehran—Siyyid Javad took up residence in Tehran the same year that Gulpaygani became a Baha'i [1876 Ed.]; the latter visited Siyyid Javad each week for some years.
- 8) Tahira 's fame and renown are well-known outside of Iran. In view of her very considerable scholarly abilities her father always expressed regret at her being a woman and thus unable to occupy his place. After the death of Siyyid Kazim she held a class in his house where many came to benefit from her vast knowledge. Fascinated by her learning and eloquence a number of Shaykhis and subsequently Babis accompanied her wherever she went. In his 14 volume commentary on the Qur'an the Mufti of Baghdad, Siyyid Muhammad-i Alusi lauded Tahira and creditied her with accomplishments not seen in scholars of his time. 65. She died a martyr's death in Tehran.
- 9) Siyyid Ibrahim-i Khalil was a leading culama of the Shaykhi school and a close disciple of Siyyid Kazim. He was famous throughout his native province of Adhirbayjan where many considered him greater than Mulla Muhammad
 i Mamaqani who claimed to succeed Siyyid Kazim. He lived many years after the Bab's martyrdom and served the Faith with all his heart and soul.

The above are but a few of scores of Muslim divines who came to believe in the Bab and who remained firm in their faith. Without going into details others were-:

10) Mulla Jalīl-i Urumi; 11) Mulla Ahmad-i Abdal; 12) Mulla Husayn-i Dakhīl; 13) Mīrzā Calī-yi Sayyāh; 14) Mulla Mahdi-yi Khū'ī; 15) Mīrzā Assadallāh Dayyāh 16) Mulla Calī-yi Bastāmī;17) Mulla Muhammad Calī Quddūs; 18)Mīrzā Hasan-i Zunūzī; 19) Mullā Bāqir, Harf-i Hayy; 20) Mullā Muhammad-i Furūghī; 21) Mīrzā Ahmad-i Mucalim-i Hisāri; 22) Mīrzā Muhammad Bāqir-i Qā'inī; 23) Shaykh Calī-yi Cazīm; 24) Mullā Mihdī-yi Kandī; 25) Mīrzā Muhammad Husayn Hakīm-i Illāhī; 26) Mīrzā Qurbān Calī-yi Istirabādi; 27) Mullā Isam'īl-i Qummī; 28) Shaykh Muhammad-i Shibl; 29) Mullā Cabd al-Karīm-i Qazvīnī; 30) Mullā Jacfar-i Qazvīnī; 31) Mullā Ibrāhīm-i Mahallātī; 32) Siyyid Ahmad-i Yazdī; 33) Mullā Bāqir-i Ardakānī.

Anyone who has lived in Iran will be aware of the level of authority which even low ranking Mullas exert. The influence exerted by the Bab on divines of the highest rank was remarkable in the light of the suff--erings surrounding their espousal of His Cause. The following words are hardly accurate: "The history of Babism up to 18 high measure of tension between the cautious intellectualizing of large numbers of Shaykhi Babis who became more and more disillusioned and abandoned the Bab in greater and greater numbers as his doctrines and injunctions jarred increasingly with established Islamic theory, and the utterly dedicated bands of saints and zealots who argued, fought, and were often tortured or put to death for a cause they often understood little enough of . to 66. There were, of course, those who abandoned the Babi Cause when tests came. This happened in all religions: why should the Faith of the Bab be an exception? 67. Those who left the Bab were not however, the people of knowledge but the ordinary believers whose names have not been recorded. Only a few high-ranking divines abandoned the Bab along with two or three mullas of lower rank. In the former category are to be numbered Mulla CAbd al-Khaliq Yazdī and Mulla Muhammad Taqi-yi Hiravi.

Mullā cAbd al-Khāliq, an eminent Mullā, recognised the station of the Bāb and, in a letter to his Beloved, expressed himself as follows: "I do not know with what tongue I should thank God for the honour of having been in your service...My Lord, my God, I beg to be honoured by being taken into the service of my Lord and Master." The martyrdom of his son at Shaykh Tabarsī shook his faith. Abbas Amanat has written, "in 1265 [AH], the death of his young son Shaykh Alī, in the Tabarsī uprising, which happened at the same time as the Bāb's claim to Qā'imiyyat, shattered the faith of the old mujtahid, and brought him to the point of denial."

Mulla Muhammad Taqi-yi Hiravi, an outstanding mujtahid from Isfahan, became a staunch Babī and translated some of the Bab's writings from Arabic into Persian. He was among the earliest converts of Mulla Husayn whom he admired very much. When trouble and calamity befell the Babīs he was not able to remain steadfast. In spite of his failure he was known as a Babī until the end of his life—he died in Karbala. None of the Mullas of Karbala were prepared to attend his funeral or attend to his burial; in the end a local mujtahid had him buried.

These were the only two high ranking mujtahids who left the Babi Cause and whose names have come down to us. Mention might also be made though of two lower ranking Mullas who denied the Bab after believing in Him.

thought

Firstly, Mulla Jawad-i Baraghani who left Babism along with a few of his associates. The problem with him was that he became a Babi in order to satisfy his ambitions. It is recorded in Mazandarani's <u>Kitab-i Zuhur al-Haqq</u> (Vol.III) that he on accepting the Bab, would be in a position to right the wrongs done to the <u>Shaykhis</u>. Mulla Jacfar-i Qazvini, a native of the same town as Mulla Jawad, has left to posterity a MS in which he has described certain events surrounding the early days of the Babi Faith. He has recorded that when Mulla Jawad first heard the news of the Bab's claims he stated, "Now the time has arrived for us to take revenge on Baraghani (an enemy of the <u>Shaykhis</u>)." Later however, he became jealous of Mulla Husayn and threw in his lot with Karim <u>Khan-i Kirmani</u>. 70.

Secondly there is the case of the lower ranking Mulla Siyyid CAli-yi Kirmani a one time secretary of Siyyid Kazim. According to Qatil-i Karbala'i he forged a letter in favour of Karim Khan Kirmani's being the successor of Siyyid Kazim Rashti. 71. When the forgery was discovered Siyyid CAli con-fessed to the forgery and stated that he had attempted to draw people's attention away from Mirza Hasan-i Gawhar — a claimant to leadership of the Shaykhi school after Siyyid Kazim's passing. He abandoned the Cause of the Bab at the time of the uproar of the divines of Karbala. Much frightened he fled to Mecca.

Apart from these divines there were many souls who left the Cause of the Bab because they had no real idea of what the mission of the youthful Man-ifestation of God was. They apostasized when, according to the Bab's own
testimony, he did not journey to Karbala—as promised — after his pilgrimage;
when the conference of Badasht took place; when the Bab defended the position
of Tahira; when the believers of Maraghih were informed by the Bab that he
has abrogated Islamic Law, and on the occasion when those who had witnessed
a miracle of the Bab in Urumīyya were put to the test or experienced persec—
ution. It was not the learned however, who left the Babī Cause on these
occasions but ordinary, immature people who could not stand up to the tests.

×

When the Bab cancelled his journey to Karbala, Mulla CAbd al-Khaliq-i Yazdī (see above) wrote a letter and asked the Bab about this. In his reply, a Tablet in the form of a prayer, the Bab explains:

[&]quot;..And Thou know that I commanded the culama to enter the Holy Land [= Karbala] for the Day of my return, so that Thy Hidden Covenant might be publicly revealed. And Thou knowest the decree about which I heard in Umm al-Qura [= Mecca] regarding the opposition of the Ulama and the denial of the remote among Thy servants who are the inhabitants of the Holy Land [Karbala]. Wherefore did I change my decision and did not journey in that direction. This in order to avoid sedition.. to the end that not a single hait be unjustly taken from the head of anyone.."

* fn. continued.

Though part of the original text of this writing of the Bab is printed in CAbd al Hamid Ishraq Khavarī's Qamus-i Kitab-i Igan (Vol. II [Tehran 128 Badīc],p.1003f) it has escaped the attention of students of this subject. Denis MacEoin and Abbas Amanat have relied on the doubtful words of Qatīl-i Karbalā'ī [his Risāla published as an appendix at the end of Mazandaranī's Kitab-i Zuhur al-Haqq [Vol III]—Ed] and Moojan Momen has written in his article, The Trial of Mullā CAli Bastami. (in Iran XX [1982], p.113ff), " Neither in the Bab's writings nor in the Babi and Bahā'ī literature is there much to indicate the cause of this change of plan." (p.140).

NOTES

- 1. Refer, Gulpaygani, al-Durar al-Bahiyya in Mukhtarat min Mu'alifat -i Abī'l-Fada'il (Brussels 1970 / 138 Badī'),p.20.
- 2. Balyuzi, Muhammad and the Course of Islam (Oxford 1976),p.1.
- 3. Qur'an 2: 284.
- 4. Qur'an 2: 252.
- 5. Qur'an 33:40.
 - 6. The Bab cited in Selections From the Writings of the Bab (Haifa 1976, henceforth SWB),p.161.
 - 7. Ibid., p. 46.
 - 8. See for example, Qur'an 29:23.
 - 9. Refer, Khulasat al-Tafasir, pp.174,184,253.
 - 10. See CAttar, Tadhkirat al-Awliya ,p.583.
 - 11. Qur'an 17:87.
 - 12. See Qur'an 97:3
 - 13. Refer, Shoghi Effendi [trans.] The Dawn-Breakers (London 19253),p.101.
 - 14. Matthew 15:24.
 - 15. Matthew 9:5.
 - 16. Matthew 15:24,26.
 - 17. Luke 16:17.
 - 18. Matthew 5:17.
 - 19. Qur'an 109:1.
 - 20. Qur'an 2:218.
 - 21. Qur'an 4:42.
 - 22. Qur'an 5: 89.
 - 23. SWB.p.119.
 - 24. SWB.p.43.

- 25. SWB.p.44.
- 26. SWB.p.60.
- 27. SWB.p.58.
- 28. SWB.p.72.
- 29.SWB.p. 72.
- 30. See Muhammad CAlī Faydī, Hadrat-i Nuqta-yi Ulā, p.153.
- 31. Refer, The Dawn-Breakers, p. 100f.
- 32. Karim Khan-i Kirmani, Izhaq al-Batil
- 33. Contra D. MacEoin, Shaykhi Reactions to the Bab..in Studies in Babi and Bahaii History (Vol.1. Ed. M. Momen),p.40.
- 34. See for example, D.MacEoin, The Babi Concept of Holy War in Religion 12 (1982), pp.93-119.
- 35. J. Carmichael, The Death of Christ (Penguin Books 1969).
- 36. Refer, ibid.,p.116. No convincing explanation as to what Christ meant by buying a sword (Luke 23:26) has been given. G.B.Caird in his The Gospel of St.Luke (Penguin Books 1979),p.241 has gone so far as to suggest that this text provides "an example of Jesus' fondness for violent metaphor".
- 37. Shoghi Effendi, God Passes By (Wilmette Illinois 1979), p. 56.
- 38. Refer, The Dawn-Breakers, p. 63f.
- 39. The Bab cited SWB.p.77.
- 40. The Bab cited ibid.,p.134.
- 41. The Bab cited Fadil-i Mazandarani, Kitab-i Zuhur al-Haqq Vol.III (n.p. n.d.; henceforth ZH [III]),p.280.
- 42. Qur'an 9 :11.
- 43. The Dawn-Breakers, pp.152-3.
- 44. Ibid.,p.166.
- 45. The Bab's gradual education of his followers is comparable to Jesus'. Early in his ministry Jesus, in accordance with Jewish expectations, represented himself as one come exclusively for the Jews. The universal—ity of his message was fully realised after his crucifixion (see Acts 11:1-8).
- 46. This cannot be refuted. cf. MacEoin, The Babi Concept of Holy War, p. 120.
- 47. Personal Reminiscences of the Babi Insurrection at Zanjan in 1850 (trans. E.G.Browne in Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society 29[1897],pp.810-11 cited MacEoin, ibid.,p.120.
- 48. Cited ZH (III), p.182.
- 49. Cited Amanat, The Early Years of the Babi Movement.. (Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, University of Oxford 1981),p.350.
- 50. MS History of Lutf CAli Mirza.
- 51. MacEoin, The Babi Concept of Holy War, p.113.
- 52. Qur'an 11:132.
- 53. Matthew 11:25.
- 54. I Corinthians 1:27.

- 55. Refer ZH. (III), p.175 and Amanat, The Early Years.., p.275.
- 56. See ZH. (III), p.175.
- 57. Cited ibid., p.470.
- 58. Refer, ibid., p. 522.
- 59. See The Dawn-Breakers ,p. 15 ff.
- 60. Refer, R. Mehrabkhani, The Lion-Hearted Mulla Husayn (p. 67-forthcoming, Kalimat Press).
- 61. See ZH. (III), p.522.
- 62. So Nabil. See the DawnBreakers, p. 87.
- 63. Refer, ibid., p.132.
- 64. See ZH.(III),p.50.
- 65. See ibid.,p.316.
- 66. Denis MacEoin, Shaykhi Reactions..p.27.
- 67. Tests are like a sieve that separate the weak from the strong. During the days of Christ many abandoned him.cf., for example, Matt, 16:19, 26:72.
- 68. ZH, (III), p.172.
- 69. Amanat, The Early Years.. ,p.366.
- 70. Refer ZH (III), p.388.
- 71. Qatīl-i Karbala'ī, Risāla in ZH. (III), p.518.